

SOUTHEND-ON-SEA BOROUGH COUNCIL

Meeting of People Scrutiny Committee

Date: Monday, 18th September, 2017

Place: Committee Room 1 - Civic Suite

Present: Councillor C Nevin (Chair)
Councillors L Davies (Vice-Chair), B Arscott, M Borton, H Boyd, A Bright, A Chalk, C Endersby, D Garston, S Habermel, A Jones, C Mulroney, G Phillips, M Stafford and C Walker
E Lusty and L Crabb – co opted members

In Attendance: Councillor L Salter (Executive Councillor)
Councillors J Moyies and C Willis
F Abbott, S Leftley, D Simon and A Atherton

Start/End Time: 6.00 - 8.20 pm

299 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor M Butler (no substitute), Councillor Buckley (no substitute), T Watts and A Semmence (co opted members).

300 Declarations of Interest

The following interests were declared at the meeting:-

- (a) Councillor Boyd - agenda item relating to IVF consultation – non-pecuniary – Dr J Garcia Lobera is GP at her practice;
- (b) Councillor Borton - agenda item relating to IVF consultation – non-pecuniary – one of the presenters is GP at her practice;
- (c) Councillor Salter - agenda item relating to Mid and South Essex STP – non-pecuniary interest – husband is Consultant Surgeon at Southend Hospital and holds senior posts at the Hospital; son-in-law is GP; daughter is a doctor at Broomfield Hospital;
- (d) Councillor Nevin - agenda item relating to Mid and South Essex STP - non-pecuniary – 2 children work at MEHT; step sister works at Basildon Hospital; previous association at Southend and MEHT Hospitals; NHS employee in Trust outside area;
- (e) Ms E Lusty - agenda item relating to Mid and South Essex STP – non-pecuniary interest – husband is orthopaedic Consultant Surgeon at Southend Hospital / Wellesley Hospital.

301 Questions from Members of the Public

Councillor Salter, the Executive Councillor for Health & Adult Social Care responded to a written question from Mr Fieldhouse.

302 Public Consultation on In Vitro Fertilisation (IVF) in Southend-on-Sea

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Executive which advised that the CCG are currently consulting on proposals to change the service restriction policy with regard to In Vitro fertilisation (IVF) in Southend-on-Sea. The consultation runs from 26th July – 26th October 2017.

The Chairman welcomed the following health representatives to the meeting for this item:-

- Dr Jose Garcia Lobera – Chair, NHS Southend CCG
- Mr Ian Stidston – Accountable Officer, NHS Southend CCG
- Dr Krishna Chaturvedi – Clinical Executive Committee Chair, NHS Southend CCG
- Mr Matt Ranguie – Chief Nurse, NHS Southend CCG

The Committee received a detailed presentation on the proposals and received an update on the consultation responses to date, including:-

- Rationale for proposal and are reviewing all services which are commissioned;
- CCG has to make £18.2m worth of savings;
- Referred to NICE guidelines and NHS Commissioning Guidance;
- CCG's need to take account of the needs of the population overall;
- Outlined current clinically based service restriction policy and the proposal being consulted on which is that the CCG would no longer routinely fund IVF and other assisted conception treatments other than for 2 exceptions;
- IVF is often unsuccessful with success rates varying between 2% and 32% mainly depending on age of mother;
- Outlined ways in which NHS can help couples;
- IVF is not routinely funded in other areas already, including within Essex – Basildon & Brentwood, Mid Essex and North East Essex. West Essex is currently looking at the provision of IVF and specialist fertility services;
- Provided some information on responses received to the consultation to date and workshop. Further workshops are being planned. The themes, concerns and suggestions will be included in final report to be considered by the CCG Governing Body.

This was followed by questions from the members of the Committee which were responded to by the CCG, as summarised below:-

- Impact of change, especially mental health – will look this as there are links between mental & physical health and will also encourage people to access other services such as Talking Therapy;
- How the CCG is publicising the consultation and encouraging people to respond – the consultation is on the CCG website and has been circulated to stakeholders and the local press, social media, stakeholder groups etc. - the CCG will re circulate information about the consultation to GP's / Practice Managers to remind them about the consultation and to disseminate. Hard copies of the document can also be provided;

- Number of responses seems low & query if representative – will provide breakdown on demographics and will also ensure differentiate between those who live in or outside borough in analysis;
- Other areas considering same matter & ‘post code lottery’ issue – will provide information on situation in London area;
- The proposals are cost driven rather than clinical – issue needs to be considered in the round and around other services which need to be provided to residents.

In conclusion, the Committee made the following comments:-

- Extremely difficult decision and disappointing that IVF will no longer be offered (funded) for Southend residents (except for the exceptions mentioned);
- Contraception pill possibly had impact on fertility;
- Right to review the service but if the CCG Governing Body does decide to go ahead with the change there will need to be careful managing of expectations (message) / human side there;
- Whether have considered impact on other services (Adoption Service mentioned);
- There needs to be more detailed analysis of responses at the end of the consultation (age range, who responded etc.);
- The CCG should consider extending the consultation deadline to encourage more responses.

Resolved:-

That the views of the Committee be forwarded to NHS Southend CCG and the CCG present the results from the consultation to a future meeting.

Note:- This is a Scrutiny Function.

303 Mid and South Essex Sustainability and Transformation Plan

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Executive which updated members on the Mid and South Essex Sustainability and Transformation Plan and the role of the Scrutiny Committee going forward.

The Committee also had before it an update briefing on current progress towards consultation. The Mid and South Essex STP is finalising a business case for potential service changes over the next five years, including proposals to reconfigure some hospital services. It is anticipated that the draft consultation document and plan will be shared with the Committee by the end of the month.

Resolved:-

1. That agreement to the establishment of a Joint Committee with Essex and Thurrock Councils be deferred to the next meeting of the Committee or when the draft consultation document and plan has been forwarded to the Committee for consideration.
2. That NHS England be invited to attend the meeting when this matter is considered.
3. That the briefing by NHS England regarding the STP be noted.

4. To note the formation of the CCG STP Joint Committee as detailed in section 5 of the Report.

Note:- This is a Scrutiny Function

Chairman: _____